

**MINUTES OF THE 307<sup>TH</sup> GRADUATE COUNCIL MEETING**  
**September 20, 2006**

**Present:** Don Pope-Davis, chair), Joseph Marino, James Merz, Mark Roche, Ed Conlon (substituting for Carolyn Woo, Jennifer Younger, Philip Bess, Theodore Cachey, Thomas Fuja, Darcia Narvaez, Igor Veretennikov, Sharon Hu, Thomas Slaughter, Graham Hammill, Christine Maziar, Richard Taylor, Scott VanJacob, Amber Handy, Michael Lundin

**Graduate School Representatives:** Terry Akai, Michael Edwards, Barbara Turpin

**Excused:** Umesh Garg, James McAdams, Patricia O’Hara, Robin Young

**Absent:** Mark Alber, Crislyn D’Souza-Schorey

**Guests:**

Rev. Timothy Scully, CSC, Professor, Political Science and Director, Institute for Educational Initiatives;

Rev. Ronald Nuzzi, Director, Alliance for Catholic Education (ACE) Leadership Program;

Joyce Johnstone, Ryan Director of ACE Educational Outreach;

David Gasperetti, Chair, German and Russian Languages and Literatures

**Reporter:** Mary Hendriksen, executive assistant, The Graduate School

**I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF THE 306<sup>TH</sup> GRADUATE COUNCIL MEETING**

Prof. Pope-Davis invited a motion to approve the minutes of the Graduate Council meeting of March 30, 2006. After a motion was made and seconded, members approved the minutes without change.

**II. PROPOSAL TO INSTITUTE A MASTER’S PROGRAM IN EDUCATIONAL ADMINISTRATION (ACE LEADERSHIP PROGRAM).**

In the early 1990s, Notre Dame founded the Alliance for Catholic Education (ACE) through its Institute for Educational Initiatives (IEI). ACE is a two-year service program in which college graduates—many of them Notre Dame students—spend their summers studying in a master’s of education program at Notre Dame and commit to two school years teaching in under-resourced Catholic schools across the country. [See <https://ace.nd.edu/>

Then, in 2002, an extension of the ACE program, the ACE Leadership Program was founded. It provides an intensive 14-month experience in becoming a professional administrator, fostering school community, and promoting spiritual formation. Participants engage in two summers of coursework at Notre Dame and an administrative internship, after which they are eligible for administrative licensure.

At today's meeting, representatives of IEI and ACE presented a proposal to expand the current ACE Leadership program by adding a degree program named "Master of Arts in Educational Administration."

The Reverend Timothy Scully, C.S.C., director of IEI, began by explaining that the proposal originated in the University's 2002 strategic planning process—which, at IEI, was a process that included input and discussion by 40 faculty fellows. Fr. Scully emphasized that the proposal for the master's program has some urgency. In the next decade, more than 70% of the religious who now lead many of the 8,000 Catholic elementary and secondary schools in the United States will retire—thus passing on administrative responsibility for the schools to lay people. It is this need for administrators, he said, that IEI's educational administration master's program is intended to address—just as several years ago the institute began the ACE initiative to address the pressing need for *teachers* in Catholic schools. Now, Fr. Scully noted, ACE is the largest supplier of faith-based educators in the country.

Next, the Reverend Ronald Nuzzi, director of the ACE Leadership Program, highlighted some aspects of the proposed degree program. First, he said, the current master's degree program offered through ACE—the ACE M.Ed—is open only to students already possessing a master's degree, which has prevented interested and enthusiastic candidates from pursuing leadership roles. The proposed master's program is directed to qualified candidates who have *not* already received a graduate degree. Second, candidates for the degree program are required to have three years of experience teaching in a Catholic school, a valid teaching license, appropriate academic credentials, and the recommendation of their diocesan superintendent. Third, participants would devote three summers and two academic years to earning the degree. The current ACE Leadership curriculum would be enhanced by the addition of eleven credit hours of required coursework in Exceptionalities in Education (three credit hours), Educational Research and Methodology (three credit hours), and Action Research (three credit hours). Additionally, the current ACE one-credit course in History and Philosophy of Catholic Education would be expanded to a three-credit course, for a total of 38 hours—28 in the classroom and 10 via distance learning.

Fr. Nuzzi then spoke of the unique nature of the proposed degree, particularly the students' access to a highly interdisciplinary faculty—one that includes professors from such fields as political science, sociology, and psychology in addition to ACE faculty and adjunct professors. This diverse faculty will benefit the students in particular, he pointed out, when they undertake their various research projects. One can envision students researching the quality of math or science achievement in their schools, or the Catholic identity of a particular school. The high quality of the ACE faculty and the interdisciplinarity they represent would allow research projects to be both rigorous and relevant.

In closing, Fr. Nuzzi noted that the proposed master's program is the linchpin of the University's Magnificat proposal. Under that program, a graduate of the ACE

Leadership Program will serve as principal of an under-resourced school, thus helping to stem the tide of Catholic school closings.

The last of the three presenters, Dr. Joyce Johnstone, the Ryan Director of ACE Educational Outreach, discussed: (1) candidate selection, and (2) assessment and review of the proposed degree program. She emphasized that the program is standards-based, with all assessment mapped to student outcomes.

As for the quality of the candidates, Dr. Johnstone explained that there are three gates for admissions: a transcript review, GRE assessment, and an interview by current and past administrators. A requirement unique to the ACE Leadership Program is that candidates must be recommended by the superintendent of a diocese or the president of a private Catholic school. Dr. Johnstone noted that each student will have a mentor in their diocese who will also attend a mentoring workshop at Notre Dame during the summer.

Dr. Johnstone also explained that every summer, exit interviews with the graduating cohort will be conducted to allow administrators to evaluate participants' experience in the program. Additionally, external reviewers—typically, locally licensed principals—will review the students' portfolios as a way to assess program quality. Finally, a national licensing examination, the School Leadership Licensure Assessment, is required of all participants. External reviews and a system of tracking program graduates will also be established. Surveys of immediate supervisors will be undertaken to assess the effectiveness of program graduates as Catholic school principals.

Prof. Pope-Davis then opened the floor for questions and discussion.

Associate Dean Akai asked the source of faculty salaries for the degree program. Fr. Nuzzi answered that the source is student fees and grants. The ACE Leadership Program is currently funded primarily through a grant from a private foundation. Additionally, as documentation provided to members in advance of the meeting explains, for each candidate, nominating schools will be asked to contribute \$4500, the nominating diocese or religious community \$4500, and the student \$3000—for a total contribution per student of \$12,000.

Mr. VanJacob said that while the Library has adequate resources to support the program now, he wonders if that will be true when the research component of the degree program grows. Additional faculty will also require additional library resources.

Fr. Nuzzi answered that in addition to the print and electronic resources outlined in the program proposal, ACE has learned that Hesburgh Library is to be the recipient of the personal library of G. Michael Pressley, former academic director of ACE and professor of psychology. The Donna and Michael Pressley collection, approximately 13 tons of texts devoted to education and psychology, will be incorporated into the library collection upon arrival.

Prof. Conlon asked about the addition of a six-hour research requirement to the curriculum. He would expect to see a statistics requirement with such a research component. He asked: Is the goal of the degree program to produce researchers or *consumers* of research?

Fr. Nuzzi responded that graduates of the program would be first and foremost administrators. Thus, the goal is to produce professionals who are literate in research and who can provide some leadership in research—for example, by identifying issues and questions worthy of investigation.

Prof. Maziar asked whether the program might identify partners for the students' research. Fr. Nuzzi said that while that would be a wonderful outcome, particularly for the Magnificat schools, the goal is to produce leaders for schools that are at risk of closing.

Prof. Merz asked whether the budget is self-sustaining. Funding for the first three years seems to come from a large jumpstart grant. Fr. Scully replied that he received news only yesterday that a most generous donor has committed himself to a contribution schedule both now and in the future that will take care of the needs of the program in perpetuity.

Noting that all candidates for the proposed degree program must have three years experience teaching, Prof. Merz then asked about the extent of interplay between the ACE teachers' program and the ACE leadership program. Fr. Scully replied that in the last 11 years, 70% of graduates overall—with the percentage rising to 80 or 85% if one looks only at ACE's most recent classes—have remained in Catholic schools past their two-year commitment. This provides evidence that ACE program graduates want to stay in Catholic education.

Fr. Nuzzi added that ACE is more than a service program. It has become the largest single supplier of Catholic school teachers in the country. And, teachers of the high caliber the program produces want to affect school culture from the position of leaders. He noted that in all spheres of education, not only the ACE program, principals are recruited from teacher ranks. In fact, in Indiana, principals must have three years experience in the classroom. While the wisdom of that regulation is debatable, Fr. Nuzzi, said, the fact remains that it is current state policy and law.

With no more questions from Council members, Fr. Informed Council members that, as discussed earlier with University Libraries Director Jennifer Younger, he will make corrections in the section of the proposal dealing with library resources.

Prof. Pope-Davis then called for a vote on the proposal to institute a master of arts in educational administration at Notre Dame. Members gave the proposal their unanimous approval.

Prof. Pope-Davis then clarified that the Council's vote is advisory to the Academic Council. The Graduate Council's vote will be conveyed to that body, which will next vote its approval or disapproval of the program. Final approval is by University President Fr. John Jenkins.

### **III. PROPOSAL TO CLOSE THE MASTER'S PROGRAM IN GERMAN LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE**

Prof. Roche, now the I.A. O'Shaughnessy Dean of the College of Arts and Letters, opened the discussion by explaining that when he arrived at Notre Dame eleven years ago as chairperson of the Department of German and Russian Languages and Literatures, the master's program in German was small and not strong. He advised at the time that strategies should be developed to enhance the program, or it should be closed and the faculty's energies devoted to undergraduate students. In the interim, there have been a few good students—even a few stars—who have completed the degree, but the field of German is small overall and the number of applications to Notre Dame's program modest. Most students interested in advanced German have their sights not on a terminal master's degree but on a doctoral degree.

Consequently, Prof. Roche said, the number and quality of students in the University's master's program in German have not been outstanding. [As explained in documentation supporting the proposal, "from 1999 to 2004, a total of 16 students applied to the program, ranging from zero to four in any given year." See Attachment A] Moreover, the experience has proved to be less than ideal for the few students—on average, two a year—who enter the program. Given that the number of students in the program is so small, the Department offers hybrid courses that include a mixture of undergraduate and graduate students. While this may work in some disciplines, it is difficult in German for two reasons: On the one hand, the linguistic capacities of undergraduate and graduate students often differ radically; and, on the other hand, the asymmetry of students is the opposite of what one might seek—for example, twelve undergraduate students and two graduate students. Thus, the classroom experience has not been what it should be for the graduate students. In addition, for the most part, a terminal master's program does not add great distinction to the University. If German faculty members wish to work with graduate students, other outlets exist—for example, the Ph.D. in Literature program or the Medieval Institute. Finally, Prof. Roche said, given that resources for graduate education are limited, it is important to ensure that the funding available at Notre Dame is used in ways that reinforce the University's aspirational goal to offer outstanding graduate education to the most qualified students.

Thus, Prof. Roche explained, he began a conversation last year with the current chair of the Department of German and Russian Languages and Literatures, Prof. David Gasperetti, about closing the master's program in German. Departmental faculty gathered in late 2005 and again in January 2006 to discuss the proposal, and while there were some tough questions, ultimately, all members concurred that the program did not merit continued support. Thus, the program closure comes with the endorsement of the department.

Prof. Gasperetti reiterated that there were no strong objections to closing the master's program—only some questions from the faculty. Actually, he noted, questioning about the viability of the program has occurred since his own arrival at Notre Dame in 1989.

Prof. Marino asked how many faculty members teach German. Prof. Roche answered that there are currently eight faculty lines, although not all are filled.

Prof. Gasperetti further explained that the German Language and Literature side of the department includes four teaching-and-research faculty members, two full-time special professional faculty members, and one part-time special professional faculty member. In addition, Vittorio Höslle is a member of the department but devotes only one of his courses each year to German. One teaching-and-research line remains unfilled.

Mr. VanJacob noted that, often, master's degree students teach language classes. He asked whether that has been true in the German department, and, if so, how those courses will be affected if the program closure is approved.

Prof. Gasperetti answered that the teaching skills of graduate students in the program have been uneven. A few years ago, there were many problems with the quality of the teaching; however, ironically, the two students currently finishing the program [no new students were admitted to the two-year program for the 2006-2007 academic year] are excellent teachers and students. His point, though, is that the quality of teaching by the graduate students is not consistently good. The department's goal and expectation is that when the teaching-and-research line now open is filled, that faculty member will teach the courses taught traditionally by the master's-level students. It should be a seamless tradition. Prof. Gasperetti also noted that on the Russian side of the department, teaching-and-research faculty members have always taught first- and second-year language classes. Replacement of graduate students by T & R faculty will make the sections parallel.

Prof. Roche added that Russian is the language program at Notre Dame with the best retention percentage from the first three semesters to advanced levels. He thinks there is a strong relation between that statistic and the fact that teaching-and-research faculty teach *all* introductory Russian courses.

Prof. Taylor asked: If the program is closed, what will happen to the funds now dedicated to it? He noted that programs should carefully consider options to expand or contract, or to terminate degrees.

Prof. Roche answered that there have been very few stipends available for graduate students in German—and they were not always awarded. The Graduate School is reallocating most of the stipend funds it reserved for German master's-level students to another program in the College of Arts and Letters. The College is reallocating some modest funding to the German undergraduate program. Its continuation will be

dependent upon that program's success—as measured by accomplishments such as the number of students who receive Fulbrights, the number of German majors, and the number of students who go on to graduate school.

Prof. Hammill noted that, at times, terminal masters' programs can be good avenues for Notre Dame undergraduates who want to do advanced work in a joint B.A./M.A. program. Was that true in this case?

Prof. Roche said that some years ago, such a model was presented to the department. Romance Languages and Literatures has done an outstanding job at Notre Dame of bringing in external M.A. students and integrating them with five-year B.A./M.A. students, then sending the students on to Ph.D. programs. The German Department never pursued this idea. Some faculty members in German proposed bringing in foreign exchange students, but the idea was presented a bit late. And, again, he said, a master's program does not provide the same level of distinction to the University as a doctoral program.

Referring to the graduate/undergraduate “hybrid” courses mentioned earlier, Mr. Lundin asked if any classes would be eliminated if the master's program is ended.

Prof. Roche said that the courses he identified will continue to be taught as undergraduate courses. If some students in the Ph.D. in Literature program would like to take one of those courses, the course could be taught simultaneously as a 400- and a 500-level course.

Prof. Gasperetti confirmed that the option will exist for graduate students to enter higher-level German classes—from either doctoral programs in philosophy, the Ph.D. in Literature, or other programs.

Prof. Merz commented that there was so much excitement at Notre Dame when Prof. Höhle came to Notre Dame. Will the closing of the program affect his flourishing at the University?

Prof. Roche answered that while Prof. Höhle posed questions regarding the closing—for he is an advocate of graduate studies and research—he holds concurrent appointments in political science and philosophy, and thus offers courses routinely in those departments as well. There is no shortage of graduate students interested in his intellectual offerings. While the master's program in German was a part of Prof. Höhle's work, it was not a major part. His appointment at Notre Dame is truly a *college* appointment.

Prof. Gasperetti noted as well that in some years, *no* students entered the German M.A. program.

Prof. Hu asked if there were plans for a Ph.D. program in German at Notre Dame. Prof. Roche said that nationally, the field is very different than it was even 20 years ago.

Chinese and Arabic language study are experiencing a huge spike in interest; interest among students is markedly smaller in German. The College had a discussion some years ago about adding Ph.D. programs in several areas; ultimately, the decision was to adopt the Ph.D. Program in Literature. Thus, if a student wanted to work with Prof. Hösle and had interests in German, that Ph.D. program would be the avenue available to him or her.

A motion was made to close the M.A. program in German and seconded. Prof. Pope-Davis then called for a vote, which was unanimous in favor of closure.

#### **IV. ANNOUNCEMENTS/SETTING OF THE AGENDA/ELECTION OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

Prof. Pope-Davis then announced that he has constituted a subcommittee of Council members to review the policies and procedures of the Graduate School as embodied in the *Graduate Bulletin*. The members are: Crislyn D'Souza-Schorey, Thomas Fuja, Michael Lundin (representing the Graduate Student Union), Darcia Narvaez, Thomas Slaughter, and Barbara Turpin. The expectation is that the subcommittee will be ready to bring at least a preliminary report to the Council at its last meeting of this academic year, with final approval to be sought a year from now—at the Council's first meeting of the 2007-08 academic year.

Prof. Narvaez asked for clarification on the scope of responsibility of the Graduate Council and procedures for placing items on the agenda.

Prof. Pope-Davis answered that the Council's broad scope is graduate education and that any member of the Council can suggest an item for the agenda. Members should send topics they would like taken up to his executive assistant, Mary Hendriksen [Hendriksen.2@nd.edu]

A member noted that last year, the Council established an executive committee [see *Notre Dame Report*, vol. 35, no. 5, p. 148 (meeting of April 19, 2005)], which has responsibility for setting the agenda for meetings.

Prof. Pope-Davis said that he will communicate with members via e-mail on procedures for nominating and electing this year's executive committee members.

There being no further business, Prof. Pope-Davis adjourned the meeting at 4:30 p.m.